



# Environment Scrutiny Panel

## Quarterly Hearing with the Minister for Transport and Technical Services

**MONDAY, 2nd SEPTEMBER 2013**

**Panel:**

Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade (Chairman)  
Deputy S.G. Luce of St. Martin (Vice-Chairman)  
Connétable P.J. Rondel of St. John

**Witnesses:**

The Minister for Transport and Technical Services  
Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services  
Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services  
Director of Transport  
Director of Engineering Infrastructure

**Topics Discussed:**

- |    |                      |         |
|----|----------------------|---------|
| 1. | Ash disposal         | Page 2  |
| 2. | Asbestos disposal    | Page 9  |
| 3. | Road Safety Strategy | Page 14 |
| 4. | Speed limits         | Page 22 |

5.	Taxi regulation	Page 26
6.	Legislation	Page 28
7.	Energy from Waste plant	Page 33
8.	Bellozanne/liquid waste	Page 38
9.	Scrap metal plant	Page 41
10.	Bus service	Page 44
11.	Sustainable Transport Policy	Page 52
12.	Parking provision	Page 54

[14:33]

**Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade (Chairman):**

Good afternoon, everybody, and welcome to members of the public and representatives of the media, and to the Minister for Transport and Technical Services and his team for this quarterly public hearing of the Environment Scrutiny Panel. We set aside until 4.30 p.m. this afternoon but we hope to finish around 4.00ish, if we can. We have set out an agenda of items to talk about. So firstly formally for the record, just to introduce ourselves. John Young, Deputy of St. Brelade, Chairman of the panel.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Thank you and your team for coming along. The first item we want to talk to you about is a series of questions on waste disposal starting with solid waste questions. We issued a Scrutiny Report on the situation with the disposal of ash earlier in the year. We want to ask you, Minister, to tell us about your progress both with recycling of the air pollution control residues, which I understand to be the toxic stuff, and also then if we can then go on to talk about what you are doing with the bulk of the material, the I.B.A. (incinerator bottom ash) products. So would you like to tell us where you are with your progress. You did tell us that you supported very much the findings of our Scrutiny review so we are looking forward greatly to hearing how you are getting on with it.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Yes, as you say, we are pretty supportive of your view and we are now progressing on with that. We are aiming to have an updated ash strategy by the end of the first quarter of next year. To lead into that and to help us with our final decisions with the A.P.C. (Air Pollution Control) we have had some meetings, done some further site visits, and we are now just about to issue a tender for exporting A.P.C. That is due to go out and we are hoping to have that back by the end of October. The bottom ash we are also looking to ... we have been investigating exporting that for recycling in the U.K. (United Kingdom). That tender will be prepared as soon as the A.P.C. one is back and we will have that by the end of January. We have done some further site visits and we are

concluding our technical work and writing up on bottom ash. We are reviewing our existing procedures and all that will come together and be written up by March of next year. So predominantly bits of work which will be progressing on with it in the next quarter are our 2 tender documentations.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

One of the things that I remember you spoke of was the need, explicitly regarding bottom ash, I.B.A., to work with our local industry to see if there was a possibility of opening up a local market. Have you had discussions with our local industry about that?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

We have. We have given samples of the bottom ash to both of the local quarries and they have had a look at those to see whether they could incorporate them into their products in some shape or form. There is certainly interest but not a great deal of interest. We have not given up on that and at the moment we will wait until the final results are back from it.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

At the moment you are looking at exporting this material?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

We have not made a final decision. We have got a number of options, export of the bottom ash is one. Recycling on-Island is two, or a combination of the two. But if we do get to the point of recycling it on-Island, what we are now learning is there is some fairly heavy expenses involved and the product which we get at the end of the day, is there a market for it; and we are not sure that there is a market at the moment.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Have you done any chemical trials? When we spoke to you last, I think one of the issues you said about you needed to be sure that the material met the standards required for use in our local market, you were going to do some chemical testing. Have you done that?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

The chemical testing has been completed and we are waiting for a write-up on that. Some of the issues which we have had are until we can get all the metals out, and it is difficult to make the material completely inert, these are things that we are learning as we are going through now. But the trials which we talk about, we spoke to you last time, they have been completed and those will be written up and included in the overall document.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Does this mean basically you need to spend money in order to get rid of those metals out of that material to make it recyclable?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Yes, is the simple answer.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Money that you have not got.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

It is money we have not got, correct. But in terms of the financial issues at a very high level, we think that the total funds which we have for ash as a whole, in both capital and revenue, could potentially fund the export of both products if the price is coming as we are expecting. Now that is not saying that we are favouring one option or the other, and the report which we will complete by the end of the first quarter will have all the options in there for recycling on-Island, for exporting and for a combination of the two.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Will this be export for disposal or export for recovery?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Export for recovery for the bottom ash.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So that, as I understand it, would allow us to do that within our environmental conditions?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

That is correct, yes.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We have found a supplier with big infrastructure investment on the south coast and potentially have an ability to import it from us at a reasonable cost. So as part of our tender process they have been involved as well. So it is potentially really good news for the Island, if we can do it.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I would like to hand over to Steve now who will pick that up.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Yes, thank you. We have touched on trials for bottom ash already so I am assuming that you have not got the results of any improvements yet that might have improved from the change in scrap metal dealership at the beginning of the year? Have we tested this out, this bottom ash?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

All the ash we have been testing is post the new scrap metal contract. The embedded metal that Chris is talking about is predominantly non-ferrous, smaller scale non-ferrous and small scale ferrous. That is in the existing bottom ash, so that is pennies and lids off jars and things like that. It is not the scrapyard residue which does not come to us anymore because of the different scrap. There was no point testing the old bottom ash because we knew it was contaminated severely with the old scrapyard residue. So all this testing has been done with the new bottom ash, with the new scrapyard contractor.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Unfortunately it is still not quite as good as you hoped it might have been.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We have not had the full tests through, the full results. It is quite a laborious test using back flushing and checking the leachate and we have certainly had a problem in terms of pH stabilisation, which is not related to the metals, so we will just wait for those results to come back.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

With this new initiative to potentially export this bottom ash does that mean you are now no longer looking at the weathering of bottom ash in order to turn it into an inert substance?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No, I think all options definitely remain open on this. I think the potential to export is another option we have been ... since the last time we spoke that we never thought would be available to us is now potentially available to us, so all the other options are still there.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Given that every day that goes past there is an increasing heap of A.P.C.R. (Air Pollution Control Residue) and bottom ash are you satisfied we are moving fast enough on this issue?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We are going as fast as we can. The difficulty with bottom ash is the testing regime is laborious. If we could produce perfect bottom ash that was perfectly usable in industry now we have still got to

develop a market, an appetite for that, displace another material, and we have got to have some way of using it. So none of this is short term fixes with respect to bottom ash. With respect to A.P.C. residue, the A.P.C. residue is being stockpiled in a safe and recoverable manner so we are currently going through significant procurement in terms of transportation and the disposal or recycling of A.P.C. residue. So there are 2 separate tenders just about to go out, which has taken quite a lot of work to specify and to find who in the market can do it.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

The A.P.C.R. pit, for want of a better word, has got how much life left in it before you start to need the next one?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It is tough. If you notice it is popping out the top now. We are thinking some sort of Christmas festivities in terms of making it look prettier but ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

The last thing we want to do though is have to build another pit for A.P.C.R.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We believe our timescales for procurement are well in advance of the timescales needed to build another pit of that standard. I want that pit emptied and I want us to before it fills up.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Our tender for A.P.C. for backlog and for the material coming out of the plant is back at the end of October, and subject to that being acceptable we could be exporting 8 weeks from that, so we could be exporting A.P.C. by the end of the year. We have certainly got that capacity in the pit until then.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Do you have all your permissions from the Department of Environment to do that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We do, yes.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

We do.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Okay. Final question on A.P.C.R. and bottom ash: have you identified places for this stuff to go in the U.K.?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, we have done a full search of U.K. and Europe in terms of where we can take most of the A.P.C. residue and the ones we are interested are on our tender list.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

And the bottom ash as well? Have you got sites identified for it?

[14:45]

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

There is one particular company who has shown some interest, yes. It is more about logistics in terms of ... this works if you are near a port. If you are away from a port and you require that secondary transfer in the U.K. then it becomes less cost effective.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Before we leave ash can I come in with a couple of supplementaries? You talk about backlog, would I be right in assuming you are planning to clear all of the backlog of A.P.C. residues in the current open pit?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Correct, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What about the bottom ash? Is there any backlog or will they just start anew, as it were, with new residues?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It will depend on what we get back from the company. We have drawn a line in the sand of what was pre and post scrapyards actually. That has been the defining point. Whether this ash is recyclable or not in the quantities we can do it. So in a perfect world we take anything post scrapyards contract change and be able to recycle that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So if you are successful in this would that mean there would be no further accumulation of the mound, for example?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It is going to be significantly less. There are always issues and Jersey has lots of things which require a controlled disposal which cannot be disposed of elsewhere. There are very small amounts of things like clinical waste ash, ash from the animal carcass incinerator, and small quantities of these things where we have got to be very careful on how we deal with them.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But the bulk?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The actual tonnage, the major tonnage, we may well be able to divert that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

One last brief supplementary question. Do these plans that you have explained to us depend on a continuing lift-on, lift-off transport service in the Island?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It is a cost that we will ... probably.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

They do?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

A straight yes or no answer would be ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Probably.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That would be preferable.



**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

There are other mechanisms of doing it by charter but for the ongoing process of producing something and getting rid of it on a regular basis the scrapyards contract relies on lift-on, lift-off, and we would be relying on that in the future.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

And the frequency of those regular shippings?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It does not have to be daily. It would be weekly. But the principle of lift-on, lift-off tends to be more economic than the ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Would the terms of any licence allow you to export bottom ash in bulk, and I mean proper bulk in a bulk ship?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

That is one of the options, I suggest, which is why I did not quite answer the question quite as black and white as you wanted me to because if you commissioned one charter vessel to ship 5,000 tonnes of it then that is a different mechanism.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

If I could just move very quickly on to asbestos. I know we are not ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Before you go there, I have a couple of questions on the transportation of the ash from the current pits to the docks. How are you going to transport it? Will it be sealed units, will it be bags, will it be ... you do not know?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

No work has been done?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

The tenders that have gone out for A.P.C. we have left transportation and the bulk out and how they move it and where it goes to the tenderers for them to come back with their most economic

solution. Now we obviously have got a specification but at the moment the tender is based on it being in bags, which is how it is stored in the pit. The bottom ash, which the tender has not been produced yet, could go out in bulk, could go in bags, but it will all need to be in some form of sealed system.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Generally speaking bottom ash is moved around in U.K. and Europe in tipper trucks because it is damp and wet at any rate.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Very briefly then, asbestos: can we assume that we are still placing asbestos which needs to be stored at La Collette in containers?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

At present, yes.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

The application that you have put into the Planning Department for a new engineered pit in which to store the asbestos is still not resolved?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

That is correct. It is still not resolved.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can you tell us again how long that has been on the Minister for Planning's desk please, roughly? I know it is a big number.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Two years at least.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I am not quite sure where to go. Do you have any views, Minister, on the Minister for Planning's latest idea that we can bring a small mobile machine on to the Island in which to treat the asbestos.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, this technology we were informed about, about 8 months ago. The senior officers have been working on this and it is something that we are investigating that is ongoing.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

How long will it take before you reach a decision on something like this?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It was my election pledge to get this sorted and it is something we are working on as fast as we can.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

You do not have much time left before the next election.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Absolutely not, but as you heard, these things take time with testing and such like.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Are you aware that the 2 visits which have happened recently at officer level have been successful, to visit plants outside of the Island to deal with asbestos?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, it was very informative.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Chief Officer, any comments on those visits?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, we visited a plant in Bordeaux which treated asbestos very successfully. We also went to look at alternative technology which ... without doing much more due diligence and getting a scope of supply from that company we have seen a technology which I think is better suited to us. It will be a technology which will be utilised on Island. We probably batch the asbestos through it and we do it with the ... in exactly the principles that we have set out from the last 5 years, with respect to asbestos, which is to get it out of those containers, which are the biggest hazard this Island faces, to put it into a safe and engineered storage pit at La Collette with the complete understanding from everybody that we could extricate it when a technology that is fit for purpose comes along and we can treat our asbestos legacy to avoid that long-term problem for the Island.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I think the panel will probably be 100 per cent behind you on this issue. Minister, is there no way that you can persuade the Minister for Planning and Environment that he needs to make this decision?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

What is really interesting is what the Minister proposed in the paper on Saturday, which is the first that we have heard of it, and I believe the first his officers heard of it, is exactly what we have been advocating for the last 5 years and yet ... I am lost for words.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

This is something we have been pushing for some time now. It is never intended to be a permanent solution but we need to get it underground so it is safe until such time as it can be remediated.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Given that that is the best practice in the U.K. as well, why do you feel we cannot persuade the Minister for Planning and Environment that we should be doing this rather than taking the chances with the containers on the surface at La Collette?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Can I just clarify, the best practice in the U.K. is to bury it.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

That is what I am ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

And leave it there. It is never to extricate it and treat it. The peer review report which was asked for by the Minister for Environment concluded that we were leading Europe in our responsibilities in terms of dealing with asbestos and having this future-proofed solution. Other jurisdictions do not do that. Other jurisdictions bury this stuff in a landfill site or in a hazardous pit and then leave it. So we have moved to the next level with keeping a really strong view on emerging technologies, which are predominantly coming from the nuclear industry in terms of nuclear clean-ups, and trying to get these companies to stay interested in us and show that we could potentially work with them. The problem we have got faced with articles like this is on the Saturday afternoon I had correspondence with a company that is based in Washington State saying: "What is going on because we have just read the headlines in the local paper in Jersey?" Now I have then got to explain to them that it is the responsibility of Transport and Technical Services and my Minister to deal with this and this article is something that he should ignore. But this is the problem we face, is when we have articles like that in the press, it takes another knock off our reputation as a jurisdiction and it is global because this cannot ... this does not just stop at St. Ouen. This was in Washington State where about 3.00 p.m. on Saturday afternoon I received correspondence from the company we have been dealing with discreetly.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What is the effect of that then in your ability to negotiate and produce soundly based solutions for the disposal in this field? What are the practical effects of that sort of situation you are describing?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It completely undermines our position as a government who is straight talking and a government who is dealing in a professional manner with other organisations. We are very small in Jersey, we are a small jurisdiction. We are only one client for these companies. It is as much about us showing them that we are credible as well as them showing us that they are credible.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So it is a breach of trust?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Fundamental breach of trust which took me quite a while to re-establish over the weekend.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But you have been able to extricate us from that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I hope so.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Whatever you choose, whatever option you finally decide on is best for asbestos, does that potentially affect what you do on ash or can it be viewed entirely as separate solutions?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Potentially the technology we have been looking at, and it is at a very pre-feasibility stage, could potentially deal with A.P.C. residue as well as asbestos. But that is very early days and you could deal with lots of the other issues that I referred to earlier on.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So as interim, one would look at the shipping for export pending technological developments?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

That is right. I am not aware of anywhere that is not a nuclear site that has used this technology. So it is very well proven but it is used in situations which are derived from a nuclear waste or nuclear contamination or nuclear clean-up operation.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

One final question on trying to explore the Minister for Planning's reluctance to deal with the temporary solution. Was there a cost to that or something? Was that regarded as an aborted cost producing a temporary storage of this material, asbestos, pending a longer term answer?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think that is a question for the Minister for Environment.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is there a cost of you doing that? If the Minister approved that today could you still do the temporary storage?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The temporary storage is an area which is a safe area for storing waste before you then treat it. That area will always be needed. So there is no additional cost. That area is needed. At the moment that area is rotting containers above ground, next to a fuel farm.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So it is not an abortive cost, you need it anyway and ... well, we need it anyway. That is it.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Exactly.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I would like to move on now to motor traffic and road safety, if I can, because time is already pressing. If I could deal first with a couple of matters in regards to roads, and the first one is road resurfacing. I remember some time back you showed us a timetable of the road resurfacing works that were going to happen during 2013 and 2014, and if I remember correctly I think the whole of La Rue à Don, from Longueville as far as Gorey was going to be resurfaced, is that still the case? If so, are you pressing on with that work?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

That is still the case. There is a media release just been prepared today going out. It will be starting works ... we have tendered the first contract, about to appoint the contractor, and we are commencing on a 6-month programme to do all that work within the next 2 to 3 weeks.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

So 6 months' work in 2 to 3 weeks. Very good. Seriously though, you will not be finished inside 2013 then?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

No, some of it will carry on to 2014. We perhaps have some negotiations and discussions with the businesses as to when the works will happen, et cetera.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Okay, that is all I wanted on that one.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

While you are still on asphaltting roads.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

The Constable would like some more drains.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

How many miles are you going to do over the 12-month period please? Given historically, and I was talking to Bill Morvan, former President of your committee in the past, and Don Filleul, and they all tell me that it was not uncommon to do 15 miles of resurfacing. It happened in my time when I was the Vice-President of your committee. How many miles are you going to do? If you are only going to tell me it is 3 or 4 miles a year, I want to know why you are not going for bigger funding.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

If I can start with the end of the question, we are going for bigger funding. We have been requesting an increase in our budgets every year for at least the last 10 years. In the current long-term capital programme we have got an additional £3 million a year programmed in which will take us up to £7 million a year, and that comes in 2015. But that needs to be confirmed as part of the budget debate in this and subsequent years.

[15:00]

So we have been continually asking for additional money and, supported by various politicians and others, our budgets have been recovering to the size that they were. In terms of how many miles a year, it depends on the type of projects. We have just completed, for example, Gloucester Street, which is a relatively short length but a very difficult, technical project in the area. We are

certainly looking now to do Rue a Don, which will give us more mileage for our money. But we have got projects like the Esplanade, outside the Grand, next year. We have got jobs in the ring road, which invariably cost more because of the time constraints when they can be done. Some of them will be evening work, some will be weekend work. Those projects will certainly be only constructed off peak. Rue a Don, for example, all those works will be done to full road closures and full diversions, which means a contractor can work for the full duration of 8.00 a.m. to 6.00 p.m., and will get more done.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

I need an answer ...

**Director of Transport:**

Can I add a little bit to that from my previous experience? If you went back a decade or 2 decades ago, the traffic on the roads was lighter and you could get away with just putting a 25 millimetre surfacing on the road. Nowadays, because of the amount of utility activity the Island has seen with the installation of fibre optics, with new drains, et cetera, often the inlay into the road has to be 4 times that depth, so you are putting in 4 times the amount of new material into the same portion of roads as they would have been doing in that day. That does not get away from the issue that you have to do more mileage but what we need to do is much deeper reconstructions in order to get a life out of the roads.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

You are still not giving me the answer. How many miles a year are we going to get for your £7 million? How many miles on average would you get for £1 million?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Unfortunately it is not as simple as that. What I can provide for you, I will get you the distances and provide it to the panel of the mileage which we have done in previous years, this year and how much we would hope to do if the additional money comes through.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Given 80 per cent of the Island roads are very ... we are like a third world country. That is how bad our roads are. Looking for £7 million when probably you should be looking for double or treble that amount, to me the Minister has got to go in and fight a much harder battle, and if he is not getting it in the Council of Ministers, bring it to the floor of the House and let the House make the decision because it affects everyone in this Island. Minister, I am expecting more out of you than you are already doing, and out of your chief officers.



**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We are having regular talks with our colleagues in Treasury and the Minister for Treasury and Resources to fulfil that. But also there is the point that we used to have I think 5 or 6 road resurfacing companies where we now have 2 or 3. So we have to put everything in a line.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

I have to correct you there. We only had one, possibly 2, road resurfacing companies when it was being done 2 decades ago. So you still have 2 or 3, so if they could do it then there is no reason why they cannot do it now.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As I said, we are still chasing funding.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I am going to move on, I have got one other heading under road safety, and that is cycle helmets. Obviously in the recent months we have had some extremely unfortunate accidents on our roads involving cyclists but we now see that we have a proposition coming forward to the Assembly for the compulsory wearing of cycle helmets. But I put it to you that any amount of references that I have managed to find here are showing to me that the overall health of the Island would deteriorate if we compulsorily ask people to wear cycle helmets on bikes, and I would like your comments on that.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I would always support the wearing of cycle helmets. I never ride a bicycle myself without wearing one. But with regards to making it compulsory I have reservations. As the panel are aware, this has been passed by the States for a compulsory wearing of helmets for youngsters but to make it compulsory for adults as well, I would have reservations. We have had some very, very nasty accidents of recent times. Some investigations are still ongoing but basically the conventional bicycle helmet are made of polystyrene and I think more or less designed that if you are doing 15 miles an hour and have a tumble that you would do not cause yourself an injury. But a lot of the modern bicycles now that are carbon fibre, that you could raise with your little finger, are capable of doing 40, 45 miles an hour no problem, in which case a more substantial helmet would be required.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Do you have any views on how we might improve the standard of some of the bicycling that is happening on the Island at the moment? Because you have just mentioned 40 and 50 miles an

hour, and I think we possibly get some bikes travelling at those speeds. Would you be in favour of reintroducing registration for bicycles?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I think logistically it would be an impossible situation to put registrations on bicycles.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

But how then would you legislate for cyclists who break the law? How are we going to reduce accidents by getting cyclists to stop running red lights, to stop cycling on pavements, to stop breaking the speed limits?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The laws are there regarding cycling on pavements and going through red lights, that is one of enforcement. I completely agree with you there. There are a few shared use areas where it is permissible to cycle on the footpath, one of which is Beaumont, and there is a shared cycle track obviously along the Esplanade. But other areas, cycling on the pavement is prohibited and needs to be enforced by the police.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

So you would like to see more enforcement?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I would like to see more enforcement, yes.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

One final question before we move on. Have you done any work on the changing of roads to purely roads for bicycles as opposed to roads that might be at the moment for cars and bikes?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Roads for bicycles?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Yes. Purely bike roads as opposed to car roads.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

So there is no work been done on that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Can I just add something? I think, having done a lot of cycling this summer with my little boy, I would say there is an issue of tolerance at the moment. There is a lack of tolerance from car drivers, there is a lack of tolerance from some cyclists and I think you have to be very careful to judge every person who either rides a bicycle or drives a car in the same way. There is a minority of no matter what form of transport you use, people abuse it. To penalise everybody for that is a very difficult and incorrect thing to do.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I could not agree more, but it is extremely frustrating for a car or lorry driver to sit at a red light and be passed time and time again by cyclists who take no notice of any sort of road signs whatsoever. You could not do it in a car because you would have an accident. Bikes get away with it because they can weave ...

**Director of Transport:**

I agree with all that has been said but the laws exist already. It is prohibited to do that on a bicycle, as it is in a car, so that is a question of enforcement. The way to make cycling safer, with the evidence from northern Europe at least, is to increase the number of people cycling so that motorists are more aware of cyclists and there is this tolerance, and I would reinforce what my Chief Officer said as well ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

That was one of the reasons I asked the question about the changing of roads to cycles only.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

One of the things we have learnt our lesson from is that the term "cycle track" is one which generates as much negative publicity as positive publicity. What we are looking at for all our future tracks is tracks for vulnerable road users, so that would be for horses, cyclists, pedestrians, walkers, everybody, the non-motor form of transport. I think in the best example probably in the western world we have got is our St. Aubin's Bay coast. The track there is absolutely multi-use. It has very little incidents and it is a great asset for the Island. We should be extending that. But I

think the term “cycle track” starts bringing other connotations and I think it is something we should avoid.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

If we could just move on to the next subheading, which is speed limits.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Before that I would like to know what action your department take in educating the cycle clubs and the like who go out in trains 2 abreast, 20 or 30 cyclists, and then they create a lot of frustration with motor vehicles, who have to follow this train for maybe a mile and then they ... these people will not even break apart. I am having complaints and, wearing my other hat, at the Parish Hall where these people in these cycle trains in fact are even affecting horse riders and the like. Where young children are having problems controlling their horses because these groups of people, who should know better, are not conforming with the law of good practice of allowing the children to go through with their horses.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

You have hit the nail on the head when you just said “conforming to the law”. I mean it is all covered in the Highway Code.

**Director of Transport:**

It is interesting because by historic standards we have very low levels of child cyclists commuting back and forth to town and cycling on the roads. The majority of the people who are cycling on the roads at the present are in fact adults and the majority of those adults are also holders of driving licences, and so therefore fully aware of the rules of the road and have been trained in that in order to obtain their licence. In terms of ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

You have got responsibility for D.V.S. (Driver and Vehicle Standards) which covers all these laws. What education are your officers taking to these clubs and societies, i.e. I am talking about cycle clubs, so that when they go out on what I call a train of these 30 or 40 cyclists, all adults, not children, in a row, what are they doing to make life easier for their fellow road users, but in particular young people, young children on horses and the like?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think it come backs to what I said before. It is about tolerance and understanding. When you are riding in a pack of such size there is a communication mechanism within the pack which moves people out and back. The difficulty you have got is 2 cyclists sitting abreast. It forms a bigger

obstruction for overtaking and that is where the tolerance comes in. They should go into single file to allow cars to overtake them safely when you can. But again I think it comes down to just everybody being aware of other road users and showing some form of ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

But do you not believe that your officers have a duty of care to make sure they get out and try and educate these clubs and societies?

**Director of Transport:**

The education function is fulfilled by the Road Safety Officer and the Road Safety Officer goes into schools and trains people in cycling efficiency. But that is part of the police force. That is not part of T.T.S. (Transport and Technical Services).

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is an enforcement issue.

**Director of Transport:**

What T.T.S. does through D.V.S. is set the standards for the driving test and provide the Highway Code and keep the Highway Code updated. That is not to say that D.V.S. could not have a greater role, and that is the type of thing that should really come out of the Road Safety Strategy. Whether it is through our own officers going to do that or whether it is through liaising more closely with the police, but there is a road safety group which meets regularly to discuss issues. I am not aware whether the issues with the cycle clubs has come up or whether there are any actual accidents have occurred through that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I think we are closing this part of the discussion. Will you agree to have a rethink about opening those discussions because it seems to me that there must be other opportunities as well, for example, management of the times these group activities take place so people know where they are going to be, what times, and so on, rather than to have it happening on a spasmodic basis at all hours and so on?

**Director of Transport:**

We do to a degree in terms of events. So formal cycling events are co-ordinated ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes, but I am talking about training runs. I know, for example, in large areas of the Island you get a large group of cyclists regularly using those on a training run and all these sort of issues do

occur. I am suggesting that is there some scope for some dialogue with the cycling clubs, greater management, times and the places they do so people know in terms of helping avoid conflict between users. Will you think about doing that within your Road Safety Strategy?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think what we are going to be looking at is not picking on one group or any other group, is I think what we should be looking at is tolerance and doing some form of campaign about ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I use that as an example, I am not targeting.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We have to be careful not to be picking on one form of road user.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I fully accept that but there is a subtle difference between being a bad driver or a bad motor cyclist or a bad cyclist and people who break the law.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I am going to move on. Phil, will you pick us up on speed limits.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Can we have an update please of where the consultation is on the speed limits?

**Director of Transport:**

The consultation on the current proposed changes at 8 locations, received 105 responses.

[15:15]

40 per cent agreed with the proposals, 21 per cent disagreed and the remaining 39 offered other comments such as other areas where lower speed limits should be considered, views on more policing and enforcement and education to reduce speed and other measures that would be needed instead of a rendition to speed limit reductions, and there are also some comments around that. The focus should be more on improving driving standards and the behaviour of drivers.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So at the end of the day your survey that you have carried out, has it been tested with the results that you have got there? Is it all evidence based because we put a report out to your department

back in 2010/11, this panel when I was Chairman, with certain recommendations and we did say at the time any speed limit reductions had to be evidence based or should be evidence based. That is what I wanted to know. Are you testing the areas that you want to put speed limits?

**Director of Transport:**

We are measuring speeds and average speeds and looking at the environment where the proposed speed limits are to be placed. But there has been a change in focus in the U.K., as well as Jersey with the Sustainable Transport Policy, whereby what the highway authorities try to do is listen more to the views of the residents and people who live along the roads and the benefits of the high speeds need to be justified. So in terms of the speed limits requested that are out for consultation at present or which responses have been received, then a lot of them have come from Parishes due to representations, from residents to their Constable, and they have been taken forward on that basis. Because if you look at many of them the change in speed is not a great disbenefit to motorists in terms of times of the journey. It does not affect industry. You are not adding significantly to the cost of industry but there is a huge disbenefit to the residents of those areas in terms of their quality of life, their perception of danger and hazard and what it allows vulnerable people to go out and do. So the whole approach to speed limits is changing right at this moment significantly nationwide.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So it is not evidence based?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

That is what I was asking.

**Director of Transport:**

There is quality of evidence as well as quantity of evidence.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

The States Police asked originally when they came to give evidence here in 2010/11 that as far as they were concerned it was not a problem and yet we appear to be asking people ... I think we all outside our own house find the traffic going too fast. But we still go at the speed limit outside other people's homes. We all want utopia for ourselves but we do not want to give it to other people, and that is what concerns me. If I am not getting the evidence how on earth can you bring

something forward just on the back of what you are saying because things are changing in England. Are we looking at other parts of the world?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think what you should bear in mind is 200 very angry people in St. Mary whipped into a frenzy over the speed limit through the village left us with no option but to change the speed limit where we believed a more subtle and psychological approach would have been beneficial, and we still firmly believe that long term. But it was a speed limit or nothing and evidence was completely irrelevant at that time. People get very emotional and emotive about this. The strength of the Constable and ourselves was outweighed substantially by the strength and depth of feeling there. So there are points where there are battles to be won and battles to just ... the outcome for us is we want our roads to be safer. We do not believe changing the speed limit does that. I think the Village Improvement Schemes we have been advocating are the solution for us and I think for many parts of Jersey, but the reality is, and I think you have touched on it, Constable, is people want everybody to go dead slow in front of their house and go at the speed limit in front of everybody else's house. That is the reality. But when you have the evening that we had in St. Mary, it puts you in a position where you think ... the battle, the fight we have to hold on to the evidence-based solution, which you advocate, is ... one of your ex members of the Scrutiny Panel was advocating the speed limit in St. Mary, which made me feel slightly disingenuous towards him and the evening. So it shows you that it was very emotional and populist movement at the time.

**Assistant Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It does go across other Parishes. I went to one where they were very keen, the speed limit was being changed, and would prefer that change to be a lot broader.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Do you get any complaints where there are, for example, 20 mile an hour speed limits? Do you get many complaints about them say in St. Peter? Do people say: "We want to go faster through the village"?

**Director of Transport:**

Once the speed limit has been established it is almost like once a new building has gone up, people become accustomed to it very quickly and we hear very little. We do not get correspondence saying: "I would like a higher speed limit in such a location." I have never received any.



**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

But there is a point where we will finish up with infinitely small speed limits if we are not careful. There has to be a pragmatic and practical solution to this. What is interesting, if you go to Guernsey and they have 25 mile an hour and 35 mile an hour speed limit and it sounds bonkers but it feels about right. That is quite interesting. Although your speedo does not really hit those figures it is a very ... what we try to do on our own policy was to make it simpler, make it more straightforward, make it sort of automatic so people understood where the speed limit would be without too much signage. I think the Island is destined to have more speed limit changes, more signage, more old school traffic and speed limits generally.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

What do the States Police say about this? Have you discussed this recently with them?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The States Police do not really have an opinion. They do not believe speed is a big part of a lot of the major accidents that have happened. One of the things the police say is if you are going to break the law whether it is 15 mile an hour ... if you are doing 75, it does not matter whether it is 15, 30 or 40. Those are the issues where you get the major accidents and the major problems.

**Director of Transport:**

There is an interesting and philosophical approach. The approach they have taken in Sweden is if a pedestrian is in an impact with a vehicle of over 30 miles an hour, the likelihood is that pedestrian will die, very unlikely to survive. So they take the view of what would be the benefit over the death of that potential pedestrian to increasing the speed limit. So if you can show for the community a benefit in terms of increasing commerce, saving money, then that is justification for increasing the speed limit. But they will only do that with associated improvements in pedestrian facilities and other safety facilities. But they turn the table round, if you like, and said: "What is a life worth?" and then compared that to what the speed benefit is.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Basically you are telling me that one of these days we will go back to 1905 and have everyone walking in front of a car with a red flag.

**Director of Transport:**

That is not what I am saying at all.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The population has doubled in the last 40 years and that is something we are trying to manage. I have had 3 emails over the weekend from Constables asking me to lower certain limits from 30 to 20. If we are at 20 miles an hour on the whole Island it is going to be gridlocked.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

One of those I know is St. Brelade. [Laughter]

**Director of Transport:**

Just before we close on it, just to say as part of the Road Safety Strategy a speed limit policy will be included in that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Right, so that is in the draft. Can we move now please to the subject of ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Will we be reviewing that when the time comes?

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, absolutely.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

A good discussion but obviously a very difficult subject at the moment. The Road Safety Strategy will be coming. Taxi regulation: this is another subject that has been a long time coming. I think you inherited previous work and you published a Green Paper or consultation paper with an intention to bring a White Paper to the States to sort out the chaotic, if I may use that word, and confusing regulation at least. Can you tell us where you are with unscrambling that and producing a rational structure for the future or bringing one forward?

**Director of Transport:**

The White Paper report is drafted. We are meeting later this week to decide quite exactly when to issue it and to prepare media releases and the like. That will go out to consultation probably for a relatively short period, say 8 weeks, with industry and anyone else who would care to comment, and then we will lodge it.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So you cannot commit to a date yet but what would be your kind of drop dead date please? You must have a point in your mind where ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Metaphorically speaking.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

The point at which you say, as Minister, committed to this change when will be the point in which you say: "This is it. This has really got to happen"?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As soon as possible. What is on the timetable?

**Director of Transport:**

It is really just sort of ... it is a logistical question to be truthful, which is, it is there or thereabouts ready to go. We have got quite a few meetings in the next 2 weeks and we will need to set a date but ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

End of the month.

**Director of Transport:**

End of the month, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

End of September?

**Director of Transport:**

End of September, beginning of October. I would try to aim for the first week of October.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That is publication of a White Paper?

**Director of Transport:**

White Paper report. So publication of a White Paper report which contains the Minister's intentions and then we will have to bring the proposition based on that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That is good news. Obviously in getting to this point, you have done an awful lot of work, and congratulations on it. Have you had any feedback from the industry so far that you can tell us about? Are you expecting that this will be broadly welcomed?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Broadly welcomed, yes. But obviously we are going to upset some people and please others.

**Director of Transport:**

There are a number of views of the industry. The industry is constantly regulated at the moment and there is a view of the Channel Island Competition Regulatory Authority, there are views we have received from Scrutiny before, and there are views we have received from private hire and from public ranked taxis. What we have tried to do is to steer a route through all of that to deliver what will be a satisfactory solution, which gives the industry the stability required to be able to make its investment, which it needs to do in vehicles and the like, but also puts the customer at the heart of any decision making. So every proposal really is there to benefit the customer in terms of safety or service provision.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That is good news. Obviously it is a difficult subject so you have been able to chart a way through that which we will see in a few weeks, which is very good news. I would like now to shift the subject to the question of legislation to do with motor traffic and so on. Phil, would you like to lead us on this?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes. Can we have an update of where we are on the previous recommendations to change the Road Traffic Law on tractors, et cetera, that is basically a 1935 law? When are we going to see some action in this area? Where are we?

**Director of Transport:**

In terms of legislation and drafting instructions for law changes, I think we need to hold our hands up that we are not progressing those kind of changes as quickly as we would like and at the moment we are looking at trying to find a better way of going about that. Vehicle technology, not just for tractors, but all vehicle technology is changing very quickly and we discussed it in Scrutiny before and we need to be sure that we have got legislation which is fit for purpose which can ... is more fleet of foot to accommodate changes in vehicle technology.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

I am really concerned, given that we read that legislation has been piling up, with the headline several days ago, and we are not taking advantage of it and getting your law drafting time that you require. Especially when I read ... the other week I had some document across my desk or on the computer, I cannot recall which, about legislation on number plates to be sold and I thought: "Wow, with all the work that is really required on various tax legislation, all this important

legislation, and we are looking at wasting law drafting time when we can sell number plates now, and you might be able to tell us where we are on selling number plates and what all that really entails because, to me, it looks as if we have got the wrong end of the spade when we should be using the legislation for doing the real tough bits of work and not just amending so we can sell number plates and make £100,000 a year profit for your department or whatever.

[15:30]

Can you tell us exactly where we are on that, please?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, there are some bits of legislation that are quite easy for the law draftsman and the Road Traffic Law is immensely complicated and has consequential effects on others laws and it takes a long time to research and go through.

**Director of Transport:**

Can I just add to that? Being able to sell number plates is an important change for Transport and Technical Services because it was put forward and accepted as one of our Comprehensive Spending Review (CSR) savings. So being able to raise money from that means that we are able to fulfil other functions elsewhere which we would have to cut. So that money which is raised through the sale of number plates represents a service which is provided elsewhere within the organisation which would not be provided otherwise.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Are we not already selling number plates?

**Director of Transport:**

No, the number plates that were sold previously, the money from that, if the Minister recalls, went to local charities as we were unable to keep the proceeds of ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

How many times have you done that?

**Director of Transport:**

Well, twice as far as I am aware.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can I ask then why if you ...

**Director of Transport:**

It was not charities really, it was road safety.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

If you can sell number plates and give the money to local charities why can you not sell number plates and not give the money to local charity?

**Director of Transport:**

Because the law ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It was the safety fund.

**Director of Transport:**

So it was a local charity, it was the community safety fund. It was because of the law was drafted.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It is a minor amendment to allow us to recycle the money.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Why can we not put a minor amendment through so ... you know, these laws ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The 1935 law is not a minor amendment, it is massive.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

No, exactly. These laws need amending.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

They do.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

We have been calling for it for years and yet we are still dragging our heels, and your department has just admitted it.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, there are amendments coming through as we speak. Obviously death by dangerous driving, et cetera.

**Director of Transport:**

While I accept that, the revenue budgets of the departments have been reduced and one of the areas that suffered, not under the management of T.T.S. but previously under its previous administration under the Home Affairs Committee ... I cannot remember the correct term, there was a number of personnel stripped out of that and one of the people that were stripped out was the person who did the research for law drafting changes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So what are you doing about getting the resources to remove this log, this block yourself? So you are going to employ somebody to do the law review by selling number plates?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, the Chief Minister has taken on 2 additional staff, I understand.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

The Chief Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is the Chief Minister's Department. Law Draftsmen, I believe 2 additional ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes, I think you said ... I thought I heard you say this is not ... there also needs a technical review ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Before you get to law draftsmen you have to develop the law drafting instructions. The law drafting instructions requires a very highly competent person who has a full understanding of the needs of where we are going to undertake that work. To do that we need money and to raise the money one of the options is to sell the number plates.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Would the Treasury not let you employ somebody first just to get on with it?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No, we have not got the budget. It does not work like that.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But you have got a £26 million, £27 revenue budget, surely £100,000 is neither here nor there in terms of getting somebody released to do this essential job?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, currently we are struggling to meet our budget this year.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are you?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. So we have got lots of pressures on our budget and taking on any more staff to do something like this is not something that we can reprioritise to do.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

This would be a temporary staff member, would it not? It would not have to be a permanent one?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

My budget has got to balance by the end of the year otherwise we are looking for a new Chief Officer. So we have to balance the budget.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So we are such a poor Island we cannot afford to review our motor traffic law properly?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No, we reprioritised ... we are prioritising in Jersey over many things, including building new schools, building new hospitals, providing a health service and unfortunately these things tend to come at the bottom of the food chain.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But as the Constable says, it is okay to spend resources on getting income from sales, that takes priority over reviewing the law for ordinary people and ordinary citizens in their lives?

**Director of Transport:**

But if you did not get the income from sales you would not be doing something else equally important. By not doing this piece of work would not allow us to do that piece of work ...



**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I am still puzzled as to why you can sell number plates and give the money to charity but you cannot sell number plates and keep the money, it just ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

That is how it was originally drafted. It was to go into a road safety fund which then reallocated money to road safety projects and I think it is a minor amendment to that to allow the money to come back into the department.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

But surely if you are spending money on road safety projects, any number of what we have been discussing for the last half an hour could be construed as road safety projects.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The fund was constituted in a different way and I believe it required ...

**Director of Transport:**

T.T.S. were not allowed to keep the money. We had to give it away.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

That is right.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

At that time ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Let us just give it away to a road contractor.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

... when I was Assistant Minister I bought a lot of the 'Smiley Sids', the speed indicating devices and they went out to most Parishes and some Parishes bought their own to supplement those. Also sleeping policemen on certain estates and closed circuit TV in certain areas, and an increase on projects like that. It went down very well.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

It sounds good but what it sounds like is a piece of bureaucracy, Minister. If you can do it for charity but we cannot do it for ourselves and we cannot do what we need to do, have you personally spoken to the Minister for Treasury and Resources about this?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, this is why we changed the wording of it.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay, well I am going to move on now. Move now to infrastructure issues, Energy from Waste plant. Minister, at previous sessions, I think, you told us that you had a number of operational problems during its initial commissioning phase before the contract was finally accepted on the Energy from Waste plant. Would you like to, again, give us an update, please? Is that now ... is that work that was necessary now finished? Is everything operating satisfactorily?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. There were some problems but that was all under guarantee.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, we have just had a summer of substantial replacement of prematurely failed tubes. That work has been undertaken and the plant is now operating as it should have been. The proposal is that we still retain a substantial amount of money which will be paid subject to a performance test which will be undertaken in November. Any defects that we have had repaired came within the defects liability period in the warranty. We have been running at full capacity for 4 weeks over the last month but we run out of waste, so down to one stream again. So we have only temporarily run out of waste because they are now bringing the waste back from where we have been storing it at the bunkers. We have currently got 4,000 tonnes stored at La Collette and 1,500 tonnes at Bellozanne to work with. That waste will start returning imminently.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That is the stockpile, 4,000?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

How long will that take to clear?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It depends. Again, these are never quite simply answers. There is enough capacity to do it very quickly but what we have found is we need to blend and mix because it is either a high C.V. (calorific value) or a very low C.V. and you have to make sure that you do not cause too many problems with the plant in terms of its operating parameters.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Is the plant operating better now with the replacement parts that you have put in, which I believe are better quality than the original ones?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, the substantial difference is the re-specification of tubes within the pylons on the super heaters. Instead of them being a standard mild steel, which we always advocated against but it was a design build contract and they guaranteed it, they have been hard faced with a very high specification hard face material which basically mitigates or minimises where there has also been a substantial redesign to the gas cleaning equipment which always worked very effectively but they have optimised that so it will minimise the amount of lime that we utilise. There has been ongoing works on the sea water condenser, which is now substantially complete. So we are where we should have been 12 months ago. Just to reassure yourselves and to the public, all of this work has been at the cost of the contractor and the original specification and contract terms and conditions have been very clear and been very well executed so that the Island has not paid a penny towards this work.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So they increased the spec on both the furnaces?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. On secondary and the first super heater.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What about the volumes of material coming into the plant? Have you seen any trends there? Is it still increasing or has it levelled off?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We have had a lot less waste. Predominantly that since the recession has been of a higher calorific value, which we have not worked out yet why. But we have had significant drop in waste since the recession.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So a drop?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Of 10,000 tonnes per annum.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Does that increase the lifespan of the plant itself?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, hopefully, yes. It does not get worn out with ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

That is 10,000 compared with what?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, we went from 83,000 tonnes down to about 73,000 tonnes due to the recession.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So that is about a 10 per cent drop?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, and it was municipal waste as well as bulky waste, which again you would expect a drop in bulky waste because there were problems in the construction industry, but it was the drop in municipal waste that was harder to understand, because that is parish waste and if you look at the population figures we see, we see population increasing which you would expect would give you a corresponding increase in municipal waste but it has not.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What about recycling? What is our performance like on that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Recycling increases year on year. I think this is the first year we have plateaued somewhat. The green waste ... we instigated charging on green waste last year and it is a bit weather dependent. That is probably the biggest tonnage of the recycling, tonnage has got quite a significant effect. Our focus over the last few years has been on getting hazardous materials out of the WEEE (Waste Electronic and Electrical Equipment) stream which does not give any big book recycling figures but it gives us a substantially better environment. So, for instance, batteries, televisions, waste electrical goods is something we have been predominantly focusing on, and metals, which does not give us a huge tonnage but gives a huge environmental benefit and that is what we are focusing on.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Do you think you are making headway into that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Definitely, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What about batteries?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

You are getting all the co-operation you need from ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Supermarkets have been very co-operative and so have most ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What about the Parishes? Are they supportive of efforts to get rid of these batteries?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, the ones that have a kerbside recycling scheme.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

And the ones that have not?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

They are not as supportive of recycling.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What are you doing about that? The Parishes that are not engaged in discussions about kerbside recycling and removing batteries and so on?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We have a very high respect for the Constables and the Parishes and we try and work with them to make sure that these things happen but it has to happen on their terms in the way they want it to be and we use the Parish of St. John as guiding light in these things.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Is this a money issue underneath it?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What sort of money to do this properly?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

The figure doubles from an ordinary collection to a recycling collection.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It depends where you are to counter that. I think for the Parish of St. John you are probably right because you have good value for money beforehand. But I think in some Parishes they could do it for the same money.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay, we will come back to that at a later date. Steve.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Yes, I have just got one question on recycling, Minister, before we move on to liquid waste. I am aware that there is a retendering for the demolition waste recycling contract at La Collette?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

That is right.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I think it is this year. Can you just very, very quickly update us on where we are there?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, we have been out for tender. We have received some bids now from the local supply chain and we are currently evaluating them.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Okay, we would like to move on to liquid waste and I will not dwell too long on this, Minister, because we have still got quite a bit to get to but I just had a couple of questions about the Phillips Street shaft, if I may. I would be interested to know, what was the initial timescale for this work, Minister?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Initially works will be complete by end of November.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

What is the updated timescale?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Currently the contractors are running approximately 12 weeks late.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Have we taken any notice or otherwise of the businesses in the Phillips Street area which have been affected by these works and are we looking to compensate any of them?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

We have taken considerable notice of them. At the early stages and during the project. We have recently been in discussions with the Arts Centre and between ourselves, the Arts Centre and the parish we have agreed to put an al fresco area outside of their business to help them support the business through this period.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

What about other businesses other than the Arts Centre?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Yes, we are in constant discussion. There is a hairdressers' and a furniture business there and we are assisting them with some ... some of their advertising.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Are you satisfied, Minister, that assisting people with advertising when they are deprived of basically walk in business for a large number of months is a satisfactory recompense?

[15:45]

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We do our best.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

One final question on liquid waste. Can I ask, very recently there was a spillage of effluent from, I think, it was the Dicq or Le Hocq during a flash flood incident and the question I would like to ask is

was the Cavern full at the time or was it just a question of the pumps at that particular area could not cope with the volume of liquid?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

My understanding of this is I think the flash flood was in that particular area and I do not think it could get through to the Cavern. I am pretty sure the Cavern was not full. That is probably the first time that has happened because normally those sort of flash floods hit the west of the Island but my understanding was it was too quick to get to the Cavern.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I think that is my understanding as well but I just wanted to clarify ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I can get that confirmed by ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

No, I mean, it has obviously highlighted an issue of extreme weather where we now have got a situation where we know one of our outlying stations cannot pump the water fast enough to get it into the Cavern.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The Dicq has always had provision for storm overflow and unfortunately without substantial improvements, you are quite right, we are not going to catch that. It very rarely goes ... I think that is the first time ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Yes, it is the first time it has ever happened.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, it is certainly the first time ... I think the Dicq has overflowed before, basically ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Yes, usually when the Cavern's full and you cannot pump any more.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

That is right, exactly, yes. But I will confirm that.



**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Right, well seeing as we might discuss this later on I am going to stop on liquid waste there and move on ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Just before I go on to scrap metal, while on Bellozanne, where are we on the redevelopment down there?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

The demolition you mean or ...?

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, and levelling off and doing all the extra works that were going on.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

All right, demolition of the old EfW, all the electrical work, disconnection work of the transformers in the base have just been completed and the main contractor is now back on site continuing with the demolition. That is programmed to be finished by February of next year, following which we are going to move on to the chimney and so we should have the chimney down by the end of next year, 2014. That starts the clearance works for the new sewage treatment works where you have got a funding bid, which we are discussing with Treasury at the moment and will be considered as part of the budget at the end of the year. If that is successful then enabling works for the sewage treatment works will progress in 2014 and 2015, and that is demolition of further buildings, excavation of hill sides, create foot prints, et cetera, but we cannot commence with any of that until we are sure that the funding bid is successful.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Fine, just quickly on that, have you got all the planning consents you need for that?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

For the ...?

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

The demolition of the hillside, for example.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

We have not, is the simple answer, and those will not be progressed until the funding bid is confirmed.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay, thank you.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Scrap metal. Can we have an update on the cleanup of the old scrap yard and when or how are we going working down at the Bellozanne site with the current scrap?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

In terms of the cleanup of the existing site, the site is still in the possession of the old company, there is a meeting next week between myself, the law officers and the lawyers representing the old company to try and confirm that they are going to clean the site to a standard which we believe will be acceptable. Those discussions have been very much prolonged unfortunately, way beyond what I believe was acceptable. That is the situation we are in. We believe the pollution there is the responsibility of the company that operated the site and we believe they should pay for it, what we have said is we are happy to facilitate clean up but it will be charged to them. Over the summer they have had a peer review of our environmental report and have some minor questions, but I am not sure whether it is ...until the meeting next week with their legal representatives I do not know where we stand on this.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Is there still funding in that account, the joint account?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I believe so, yes. Substantial funding.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Can I just be quite clear, Minister, your Chief Officer says that the company are still responsible for the site yet their contract for the scrap metal is finished. So their contract and their lease on the land are 2 separate and unconnected documents?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, the lease ... there was only ever a lease but their responsibilities within that site are still ... we have not taken the keys back so it is still their liability.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

But they are not paying any rent for it?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Where the current scrap operators are working from, I take it that is a clean site and it has been tanked ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, there is an interceptor and ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Interceptors and all the rest are on site. Given that it is partly a building site and they are working around other contractors, does that mean that they are not paying rent or whatever? What have you got in place to make sure that we are getting 100 per cent value for money and we are not subsidising?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

What we have done is we have had to compromise because of the problems we have had with the existing site and we have also got a company that have been very flexible and are operating in a site less than half of what we promised. So there is still a financial return to ourselves but it is not as great as it would be if we were able to give them the full site because there are some processes they cannot do. But credit to them, I think they have done a super job on a really limited site, next to a big demolition site and we are hoping when the demolition is completed to give them a bigger area there while we develop a final solution for them on another location.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Also providing financial return to the customer.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

We would hope to have the move to a new site by the end of 2014. So in the interim period they stay where they are as the demolition progresses on and the chimney comes down their site increases and in the meantime we will be constructing the new site elsewhere hopefully moving at the end of 2014.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

What are your plans for when the old scrap yard area is remediated and brought into an acceptable condition, what are your intentions in regard to that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We do not have any at the moment.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

You have got work in progress to examine the options?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We view a space like that as a great opportunity but it is very limited in terms of its accessibility. We did consider a more public accessible recycling centre there but the residents were ... and the access is difficult there so we have backed off on that but it is a substantial site and a site which certainly for a light industrial application and application for being sublet to other companies for maybe skip sorting and various other things it is quite a nice site. So it will certainly be utilised. Currently as T.T.S. we do not have any short term needs for it. What we want is it cleaned up and fit for purpose for whatever the next purpose is.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So it would not be for digesters in the foreseeable future or anything like that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No, no, we will explain our plans after this meeting.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Once the legal issues have been resolved the cleanup will likely take about a year. Once that clean up is complete it is, along with Bellozanne, one of the sites that has got planning permission for waste activities so we would not like to be giving that up at this stage. In our overall review of La Collette and Bellozanne, it will definitely have a need for us.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So you have got until the end 2014 to make decisions then if it is going to be ... it is going to take a year to mediate at least.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Yes.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

As soon as we get financial agreement in terms of doing remediation we will instigate that immediately.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay, thank you. I am going to move now to the last subject on our list, which is transportation. A simple question really on the bus service. When we last had a quarterly meeting, Minister, we discussed the initial start up phase of the bus company and you agreed that after the first quarter was complete we would start to see some publication of statistics, performance figures, to show us how the bus service was working. Are you in a position to publish those and can you give us any information from it, please? Not in detail but can you sum up the main ... assuming you have the information, Minister.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Of course we have the information, he said he was going to have.

**Director of Transport:**

Some of it is still a work in progress. In terms of the environmental performance K.P.I.s (Key Performance Indicators) they are being met ... public information K.P.I.s are being met, timetable ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

K.P.I.s being?

**Director of Transport:**

Sorry, key performance indicators. They are being met. Vehicle availability, that the buses are mechanical fit and able to out on the road, they are being met. The same in terms of cleanliness. There have been no cancelled services, all the services have been running. In terms of tracking the buses, so this is the sort of real time information for the timeliness of the journeys, which is the bit I think you are really interested in. All the vehicle tracking equipment is now working apart from the Bluebirds, which is the small buses, and we are having discussions with the manufacturers of those buses to try and resolve some technical difficulties on those. We are waiting for the winter service to be introduced and get that up and running until we start going live with those reports. So technologically we are just about there, we are running about a month behind schedule and hopefully by the end of September we should be able to provide those reports and which buses are running to time and which ones are not running to time.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So are we saying at the end of the September we will see some reports on the second quarter this year or are we saying ...

**Director of Transport:**

No, you will be seeing them for the winter timetable. So basically what we need to do is to get the buses running to the winter timetable so we have got the base data and from there we can publish our results as to the timeliness of those buses.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So does that mean we will not see any numbers on the performance of the bus service until the end of 2013? We will get those numbers ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We have got the overviews in terms of total ridership, income and various other things, we have the overviews ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So what can you tell us about those?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think what Tristen is saying is the actual detail of the K.P.I.s of each service on each day ...

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, I suppose what I am talking about ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Is the bigger day to day segments, but the overall performance of the company and how it is doing, we have those figures.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can you give us a flavour of that?

**Director of Transport:**

The bus ridership seems to be at its highest level ever based on revenue taken on the buses and we are running about 4 per cent above what is being run ... in terms of ridership we have got 4 per cent over and above what we have had in previous years. So the bus service seems very successful.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The income is higher than forecast so it is a very positive message.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So does that mean that our subsidy will go down?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The contract mechanism slightly different in that they keep the income but then we have a profit share mechanism with the company, so it will be back another way.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So we will get back the benefit of that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes. Good news for everybody.

**Director of Transport:**

The intention is to create a virtuous circle whereby we invest some of the money we receive back from the company into bus infrastructures, making the buses more pleasant and easier to use in terms of bus shelters and the like, and increased ridership and get less vehicles on the road and there is a public good for everyone.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

One of the main reasons that we have identified in discussion with yourselves over the last few months for buses not keeping to timetable has been the time it takes to get people on and off buses and you have given us some assurances earlier this year that we would be moving to swipe cards. What progress can you tell us about that?

**Director of Transport:**

Good question, just back from holiday today. Swipe cards have been used this summer, i.e. for tourists. So they are using smart cards for their travel. Tourist weekly passes and the like have been used. It has been piloted in one of the schools and it is intended that smart cards will be rolled out in the next month or so.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

For everybody?

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, over the next couple of months.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

One of the issues we have had with industrial relations this summer is it takes the same people who are delivering the change benefits, it is the same people who are delivering the industrial relations so it just puts everything back unfortunately. The industrial relation issue that we have faced this summer required enormous amounts of background work to guarantee a service in Jersey which I believe was in place, was done. We have got drivers trained up and everybody's ready to go and there was a substantial amount of work that we did, which then just puts everything else back.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

But inside another month swipe cards for everybody will be available?

**Director of Transport:**

A month or two, yes.

[16:00]

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Then people will be able to walk on the bus, literally swipe and not have to make any payment or receive a ticket or anything?

**Director of Transport:**

No, they will still receive a ticket. Receiving a ticket is very important in terms of the fare detection and that ticket gives us the data that we need ... the production of that ticket leads to most of the data that we need and also the data the customer needs in order to make a complaint.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

You have told us about the winter timetable, I understand it is going to be the summer one carried on, is that right?

**Director of Transport:**

It provides a similar level of service to the summer timetable, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So therefore the winter timetable for 2013 will be much better than winter timetables we have had before?



**Director of Transport:**

Absolutely, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So is that the main ... is that, if you like, the first tangible major milestone of the improved service?

**Director of Transport:**

That is the first step up from the previous bus service the Island has enjoyed.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

What Tristen has touched upon, we are putting up as many bus shelters as we can, as funds allow to make it more comfortable experience.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Bus shelters. I came along from Gorey to St. Helier and I started counting them. I stopped counting at about dozen of them because there was still dozens of these all the way along the route and yet I do not see them in other parts of the Island, like the proliferation there is from east to west and yet when you get into the country areas we hardly see buses, where we have to wait a long time at shelters yet we do not have them. Can you not put them in the rest of the Island?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, as I say we are putting them up as soon as funds allow.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, but you are putting them up along the south coast.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

That is the highest bus usage at the moment but we are coming north.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Will you be putting one up at Plémont when the 28 houses are out there and they have to wait 3 hours for a bus?

**Director of Transport:**

Certainly when there is a new development we look for planning obligation for something in the form of shelter of some form.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I did ask the Minister for Planning.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Could I just add one last question about buses and that concerns the harbour. I appreciate that regular buses to and from the harbour are not something that we require in as much as boats come in at very irregular times, but do you feel that some time in the future we could look at ways of transporting our visitors from the harbour into St. Helier because it is something we need to do for the tourist industry of the Island. I think asking visitors to walk off a boat and then face the walk into the middle of town when the weather might be a bit adverse or some of them may not walk very well, and I think it is something that should be addressed? I appreciate there are problems with meeting timetables but could we maybe try and see if there is ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

This is something we brought up in a meeting with Liberty Bus last week and they are receptive to it but as you pointed out it is how many boats a day are we talking about. That is the main problem. Nine times out of 10 the bus will be empty but obviously there is a need there and we need to look after our tourists. It is something Tristen is still discussing with Liberty Bus.

**Director of Transport:**

One of the problems with that, it is part of the proposals for the town service which is unfunded at the moment but because the boats come in at the same time as our peak vehicle requirement for the rest of the bus network ... so when the buses are all out picking people up to bring them into town that is sort of the same time as when the buses are coming in. So ideally what you would do is provide a harbour type service as part of a town service which would then operate all day.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

One of the difficulties one faces though is that the vast majority of the day there are no boats coming into the Island at all and then 2 ... a bit like buses, 2 come at once and you are literally faced with hundreds of people sitting at the Elizabeth Terminal who all want to go into town. I am not saying I have the answer because it is a really difficult situation but we do need to try and resolve somehow.

**Director of Transport:**

But in order not to take a vehicle out of the commuter service you need to have separate vehicles and those vehicles are better on the town service that would operate all day and visit the harbour.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But now what you have told us is that ridership is up, the income is up and that we know ... I think you told us previously there are new drivers under training. Surely that gives you a potential of being able to expand that service into the town service, whereas previously I think that was knocked back in the medium term financial plan. Could it not go into that?

**Director of Transport:**

The town service is a different type of animal from the scheduled bus service as the journey distance is very short and it would be ... typically the town service is proposed to be at very low cost so it would be unlikely that the fare revenue that would be raised would cover the cost of town service hence the funding request.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Yes, but what I am thinking about, I am assuming you can cross-subsidise routes, can you not? Are you saying that CT Plus will only run routes if each individual routes is a paying ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No, we run the route to St. John, do we not?

**Director of Transport:**

The No 1 and No 15 effectively pay for all the other routes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So there would be no objection, for example, funding a town bus which would include a harbour service to pick up those tourists that we have all seen lumbering massive suitcases around being paid for within the general profits or the ...

**Director of Transport:**

There would be no objections to that but the order of cost of the town service would be unlikely ... for a town service, a successful town service is unlikely to be available from the revenues raised from the rest of the bus service, given that we need to still continue to provide buses out to the country Parishes and we are doing things like running Sunday services or 7 day a week services to those areas.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Have you given up trying to get the Minister for Treasury and Resources to provide some funding for that, Minister?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, we never give with the Minister for Treasury and Resources, it is always ongoing.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Can I come in our bus routes, et cetera? I wrote to you over a month ago, Minister, emailed you about a bus stop which stops directly outside the entrance to Millennium Court, which has got, I do not know, 30 or 40 flats, and it stops for anything between 2 and 5 minutes when they ... whatever they do, when they are getting on I suppose, paying, and the residents of that court are somewhat frustrated that you have not even had the courtesy to reply to the email I sent on their behalf until this morning when you said you were looking into it. What has actually happened?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I replied to you at the time, Constable, and I also replied to you again yesterday. As you have just heard, Tristen is back off holiday now so I have asked him and our senior engineer to look into it.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Because there is no reason ... there is a lay-by next door or parking next door and you can put a lay-by there instead of right in front of any entrance of any property across the Island. I think it is very poor designing on somebody's part for that to have happened.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There are lots of things involved, obviously junctions with the road, et cetera, but as I say, I have asked Tristen and our senior engineer to look into that.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Okay, thank you.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I am sure, Minister, we will be coming back to the subject of buses next time, but it is good news to hear there is some progress there. We look forward to the publication of the first year report as well. Steve, you want to pick up on sustainable transport?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Just one quick question on sustainable transport, Minister. We have heard this afternoon that bus travellers are up. I think it is fair to say that year on year cycling is up as well, therefore can we deduce that there is less carbon emissions happening and we are meeting the requirements of the Sustainable Transport Policy?

**Director of Transport:**

There is a progress report going to be published at the end of September on all the aspects of the Sustainable Transport Policy. A summary of the key findings is the use of public transport is up 9 per cent since 2007.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Is that not a long time to be ... a long distance back, you know, 9 per cent since 2007 that is nearly 14 ... nearly, sorry, 5 or 6 years?

**Director of Transport:**

It is put into context within the report. These are the key findings of the report and that goes back to the original proposition that was taken to the States. Road fuel use is down 10 per cent on its peak in 1994, roadside pollutants are significantly reduced. The piece that you are interested in is peak hour traffic levels are down 1.7 per cent over the last 4 years.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

What was the target in the Sustainable Transport Policy?

**Director of Transport:**

The target in the Sustainable Transport Policy was to reduce road traffic by 15 per cent.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

So we are a long way short?

**Director of Transport:**

We are still a long way short at the moment, yes. But that said, what will give you the biggest change in terms of modal shift is buses potentially and the bus service is only now just beginning to step up in the service it is providing. There are more people using the buses.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

In particular over the last 10 months since the new company has taken over you note a huge increase in take up.

**Director of Transport:**

Well, going by the revenues we think that ridership is up 4 per cent and it is higher than it has ever been before. We are working on that just to refine that figure and we will produce something better than that by the end of the year. Overall traffic level has been constant over the last 6 years

despite having a 1 per cent increase in the overall population per annum. There has been a growth in walking, cycling, which has been small but positive.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Minister, we are miles short of our target on reducing car usage, what are we going to do about it?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

As we say, walking is increasing, cycling is increasing, bus ridership is increasing, we have doubled our population in the last 40 years so we are doing everything we can to encourage people to use public transport or other modes of transport.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

The number of vehicles registered in the Island, is that on the up?

**Director of Transport:**

I could not tell you exactly but the number of vehicles registered in the Island is not an accurate figure because there are issues with people returning log books and the like.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Some people have 4 or 5 cars but they only drive one at a time, but it is something we are working on.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I will move to parking. Minister, I think we had lots of discussions with you and your team about the impact of the decision to make Green Street the new police headquarters and the Minister for Planning made a decision that he would put a requirement upon you to put some extra parking in Green Street. Can you tell us what the additional impact of that will be, please, in terms of both the impact in the short term while the thing is being built and in the longer term?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

This is something that obviously from the T.T.S. point of view we fully support. I was not the sponsoring Minister for the police station but it is not a hugely difficult construction in as much as the up ramp and down ramp are already there and we are already extending the top deck further along. I am not sure of the timetable. Tris, more info on that?

**Director of Transport:**

During the construction period obviously there is going to be some disruption because the top deck of Green Street will not always be available while people are setting up steels and the like for

safety reasons. The programme for construction I am not certain of at the moment but my understanding is that it will start ... I am going to have to come back to you on that, sorry.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

I think a simpler question perhaps is that work for the extra floor, which is concrete so will have an impact temporarily going to go on concurrent with the loss of outside parking due to the construction in Green Street?

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, a lot of the outside parking ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So we will lose 2 lots. We will lose the 90-odd spaces as a result of the site being appropriated for the police headquarters and then we will lose space while we build extra space.

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I would envisage the car park being constructed prior to the police station.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Sorry, you anticipate the car parking being constructed first?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Either just first or simultaneously. I would imagine it would be done first for the concrete pour.

**Director of Transport:**

We do not have the detailed construction programme but ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Are you worried, Minister, about the impact of losing still more car parking spaces even on a temporary basis?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

We have always flagged up the issue, since losing the Town Park, of the challenges we face with Ann Court. Ann Court will be a housing site done by probably a private developer. That area of town lacks any provision. Then you have the Green Street issue, then you have got issues on the Esplanade and it is about the time that the contract is, I believe, there is a substantial risk of a high pinch point in terms of car park spaces in that area.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

The issues on the Esplanade, sorry, what is that?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Although there will be provision, equivalent provision, of Esplanade built across the underpass on the other side, as a convenience it is not nearly as convenient to the public. So it is going to be another escalation ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So you are not anticipating a temporary loss of spaces or anything?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

No, there will not be a loss of spaces.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

We are being told by the States of Jersey Development Company that there is not an issue.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, there will not be a loss of spaces while the construction is being built but it is a loss of convenience because Esplanade is probably the most convenient car park for the majority of ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

We do not have a parking problem, we have a location problem. Plus we have 250 spaces daily at Pier Road but people do not wish to park there because ...

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

I think there is a risk of the public being inconvenienced over a period of time due to the temporary works and the potential interlocking of these different construction phases.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Does Phillips Street come back as a car park when we do the Green Street works or is the intention not to return ...

[16:15]



**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It depends how quickly the developer cracks on with it but there is pressure on to solve a lot of the issues of social housing and to kick start the economy in terms of local construction so I would have thought that would be fast tracked now so ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Is there a planning application in for housing on that site?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

The intention at the moment is discussion with the Homes Trust, provide it to Jersey Homes Trust to develop out. It is not going to go across within the corporatisation of the Housing Department if that is successful.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

They would have to put an application into the department ...

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Yes, an application ... there are some initial drawings that have been developed by the Homes Trust architect and they are hoping to be on site for early 2015. So there will not be a huge amount of time ... once the drainage project is complete there will be 6 months or so before the site is lost completely.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

I have not been in the car park but how much of the existing tarmac that was in the Phillips Street car park before they started is still there? Have they just dug a hole at one end?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

Just the one end.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

So it would not take a lot of work to put that back as a car park even for 6 or 9 months?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

No, there is a loss of 70 spaces because of the compound. Those spaces are being provided in the Le Coin site adjacent and also in the brewery site, the old brewery site. So at the moment there is no loss of total spaces.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

No, but I am thinking about the loss of space when we start any work in Green Street, whether that is the police station or the upper tier.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

In terms of replacing the site at Ann Court for the full duration of the drainage works to be completed, you are right it is a relatively quick operation. In terms of building out Ann Court for the social housing, it will be a complete loss of the car parking there for probably a 2 to 3 year period.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But is it not the case that if we are going to have quite a few ... I heard you say, I think, there is a problem brewing, a pinch point ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Potential, yes.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

... about the east of town area, particularly with all of these construction works. Is there not the case that at least if that site is yours, Phillips Street, for holding it back ...

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

The site belongs to Housing, we are currently leasing it as a car park. Housing will transfer it to Property Holdings, or are about to, and Property Holdings will then arrange a transfer to the Homes Trust.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Minister, we have not heard much about Snow Hill lately. You did publish a feasibility proposal that you could get some additional car parking in there. What has happened to that?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

The report has been issued to the States with the ... I think people were generally in favour but obviously it was quite expensive and that is as far as we have progressed with one at the moment.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Why has that been delayed? When you say it is far as you have done for the moment, given that there was a big rush a few months ago that it had to happen ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

There was not a big rush. I was charged with doing that as part of the S.T.P. (Sustainable Transport Policy). I believe it was the Constable of St. Helier brought an amendment to that effect.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The commitment was to produce the plans.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

There was a requirement to bring the plans to the States as part of the S.T.P. and Constable Crowcroft wanted to do that to try and bring all the previous studies together. So the work that was done previously met that requirement. The studies were brought together and a feasibility report went to the States. Now, the scheme that came forward we would support and it is feasible to construct but there are no funds available. It has been brought back to the States for the States decision as to whether they want to provide the funding.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

The States have not discussed it, have they? We have not had a proposal to approve it or not?

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

There was a requirement ...

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

Do we know how much the feasibility study has cost so far, Minister?

**Director of Transport:**

The feasibility study for Snow Hill, that cost us £50,000

.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

£750,000?

**Director of Transport:**

No, £50,000, just under.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

How many spaces would you get in Snow Hill?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

An additional 90, I think, 92.

**Director of Engineering Infrastructure:**

It is an expensive build in terms of car parks.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Does that mean you think it is better used for something else?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The difficulty with it, I think you have the historical elements there which we sort of touched on in the sort of workshop we did. We have got issues with the residents which we did not really take beyond that point and the cost per space is substantial. The other issue with it is you have got to deal with the challenges of gaining access into the infrastructure below there but probably the biggest ... for me the biggest issue is to be able to engineer it so you have a walkway underneath which is not an enclosed walkway and it stays light and airy because the potential, there is substantial through element that ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

But did the S.T.P. not look at all those issues?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It did, which is why the scheme became very expensive.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Right, so you found all the solutions to these but we had a feasibility study that has not got anywhere? It is a money issue?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, for me I do not think it is good value.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

I am sure the Minister for Treasury and Resources has got his way through now anyway.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

So are you going to be discussing ... will be discussing this issue of car parking pinch point in the east of town with the Minister for Treasury and Resources, with all these sites so we get some sort of strategy?

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Yes, we have an alternative solution which is currently ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can you share it with us?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Not at the moment, no.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

It is secret.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

It is sensitive and a bit too confidential. On that we can talk when the mics turned off.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Too confidential for a Scrutiny committee.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

Under the public guise, yes. We will talk to you about it afterwards if you like, but there is an alternative solution which gives the States far better value for money.

**Director of Transport:**

Just finishing back on Green Street, your original question which I rather fluffed. We are working closely with Jersey Property Holdings, we have provided a performance specification and the police station and the extra deck on the Green Street car park will be structured as one project, once that is tendered we will be working with them and in conjunction with our performance specification order to minimise the disruption and the period of disruption.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

One last thing, Steve?

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

No, I am finished, time is up. I have got all my questions ticked.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

I still have one. No, carry on I have not.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Provision of motorcycle parking spaces and cycle spaces in town. Do you consider you have met that requirement?

**Director of Transport:**

We have certainly significantly increased the supply of motorcycle parking. Again, though, it tends to generally be on the south of town. So we have increased the amount of motorcycle parking, I think, overall by about 30 per cent over the period of the Sustainable Transport Policy but mainly along the Esplanade.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Thirty per cent equals how much?

**Director of Transport:**

I cannot tell you, I do not have the figures here I am afraid.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

But are those new places all full?

**Director of Transport:**

Yes, the demand for motorcycle parking is huge and motorcycling is becoming increasing popular and prevalent and we would like to find sites with more spaces in other areas in town but we do not have them available at the moment.

**The Deputy of St. Martin:**

On the basis that you can fit a lot more motorcycles into a car space, why do you not just take out some car parking spaces?

**Director of Transport:**

Again, the issue is really geographic location. So our commuter parking is only 80 per cent ... we have got 20 per cent spare capacity in terms of commuter parking overall but it is the location of it. It is all in the south of town. We do not have it ... it is the other areas that want parking. Both cars and motorcycles.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

How much of your parish ... sorry of the States roads that you are responsible for is handed over for parish parking, i.e. with this residents' parking scheme?

**Director of Transport:**

Residents' parking scheme.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

What percentage?

**Director of Transport:**

That is a very good question. Again, I am sorry I do not have those figures, we can supply them to you because we produced that for an answer for Constable Refault to the States question recently during the last sitting.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

It would be useful because an area ... the parish I believe get the revenue and you do not get the revenue and yet you are paying for maintenance. There is something wrong there and you should be getting ... or the taxpayer should be benefiting.

**Director of Transport:**

The portion of actual States main roads when we went through it was relatively small.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Going back to these parking spaces, you say you want more sites. Are you in discussion with Property Holdings about releasing those? I mean, there must be around town dozens of publicly owned sites, not in your administration. Are you in discussions about getting those done?

**Director of Transport:**

Property Holdings are aware that we are looking for sites for more parking and come up with suggestions periodically. None of those ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

How often is periodically?

**Director of Transport:**

Well, we have Le Coin that has come through Property Holdings, we have also had access to Ann Court and Charles Street through work with Property Holdings. There have been other sites that have been suggested which have not been suitable because of access.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Could you tell me, Minister, given that you sit on the Council of Ministers and Property Holdings comes under the Minister for Treasury and Resources, what pressure are you putting on him to hand over States owned car parks that they all come under your remit? I am thinking in particular

the one at Elizabeth Harbour, which the revenue goes to Property Holdings and it should be going to your department.

**Chief Officer, Transport and Technical Services:**

The revenue goes to S.o.J.D.C. (States of Jersey Development Company).

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, sorry, yes. The States of Jersey Development Company, when the revenue should be going to your department to help fund maintenance of highways and new car parks. So what pressure are you putting on your colleagues around that table?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Unfortunately that is historical at the moment, the way that has been laid out.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Historical or not, what pressure are you putting on your colleagues around the table?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

I am not putting pressure on them but they are aware that we need every parking space we can get hold of. They are aware of that and we are working towards that. Any spare space we can get which we have done with other departments, with Housing and all the other departments, we are utilising that.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

So therefore you are not putting pressure on your colleagues, in particular the Minister for Treasury and Resources, who has a lot of say in what goes on in ... money to the S.o.J.D.C ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

States of Jersey Development Company.

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Yes, where the funding will go. You are quite happy to see money that should go into your department going into somewhere outside the department?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

Well, as I say, the States of Jersey Development Company is a separate entity but with regards to the Treasurer and the Assistant Minister for Treasury, they are well aware we need every space we can and every plot of land ...



**The Connétable of St. John:**

They are aware yet they are not prepared to hand that over to yourselves?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

It is ongoing negotiations ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Why do you not bring the item to the States to make it happen? Bring a proposition to the States ...

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

They are aware, I do not think we need a proposition, they are aware ...

**The Connétable of St. John:**

Well then the States would make the decision instead of the Minister for Treasury and Resources.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Can I just broaden that, Elizabeth Harbour, is that your car park?

**The Minister for Transport and Technical Services:**

No, it is not but ...

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Why are there no bike racks there, for example? This is silo thinking, Minister, we are talking about a need for car parking, the need for cycles, the need for motorcycles, the need to have a joined up transport strategy. Why have we not got all of our car parks providing these sort of facilities right across the urban area?

**Director of Transport:**

We are working towards that. In terms of ... people think that there is a shortage of parking. The problem is not the number of parking spaces that the Island has available, the problem is their distribution and so in terms of the long-stay parking we have, it is 82 per cent utilised. On street car parking is 79 per cent utilised and short-stay car parking is about 60 per cent utilised. The problem is the distribution of it and what we need really is sites that are on or close to the ring road in the north of town area. We have been speaking about other areas but they all tend to be in the south of town where we do have quite a lot of short parking capacity.

**Deputy J.H. Young:**

Okay. I think we have had a good thrash on this and I think there is an issue there we will go back to on another day. I will just ask my colleagues if there are any more follow up questions? Minister, I think with that I am going to close the session. Apologies we did not meet our timetable of an early finish but it was such an interesting conversation on subjects I wanted to let it run. Thank you for all your information, Minister, and all your colleagues as well. Thank you. I will close the meeting.

[16:28]